



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

JUDAISM AND CHRISTIANITY.*

By Professor D. G. Lyon, Ph. D.,

Harvard University.

The scope of this work is sufficiently indicated by the title. That Christianity is the outgrowth of Judaism is now an axiom, but no scholar has hitherto set his hand to the task of presenting in a comprehensive way the history of the development. There are those who hold the view that the so-called "inter-Biblical period," extending from the date of the last Old Testament book till the beginning of our era, was a time of intellectual and spiritual stagnation in Israel. Prof. Toy shows, on the contrary, that the two hundred and fifty years preceding the birth of Christ was a period of great importance for Jewish thought, witnessing the rise of doctrines which appear in full form in the New Testament, while in the Old Testament they are either unknown or are but vaguely hinted at.

The introduction of 46 pages is a discussion of the general laws of advance from national to universal religions. This discussion is justified by the author, because he considers that Judaism gives rise to Christianity "in conformity with a well-defined law of human progress." The social basis of religion is the first point considered and it is shown that religion is a human product, subject to the same laws of growth, arrest, retrogression and decay, as apply to society in general. The general conditions of religious progress are then stated. In a growing community religious ideas are being constantly refashioned under the influence of politics, art, science and ethics. With increasing intercourse between nations various religions exercise greater or less influence on one another. Local usages become abandoned, ideas are broadened, a central religious idea is adopted by the community under the control of some leading mind. But these changes can produce a universal religion only in response to a demand of the times and as "the outcome of generations of thought." In extending beyond national limits the universal religion prevails over others by regular laws. The third division of the introduction considers the actual historical results. Only three religions have grown into universal form, "Brahmanism into Buddhism, Judaism into Christianity, and the old Arabian faith into Islam." These all illustrate the same laws of progress. Mohammed "fitted his transforming ideas into the existing social system," combining "an idea and its dogmatic ritual clothing into a unity which answered the demand of his time" (40). And so with Christianity and Buddhism. "The other outward conditions of progress were also fulfilled in the rise of these three religions,—religious vagueness and emptiness around them, distinctness, organization, and enthusiasm within them" (40). The smallness of the number of religions which have reached the universal form is due to the mass of conditions which have to be met. Failure in any one of these makes a stunted or arrested growth. Thus stoicism and Confucianism lack

**Judaism and Christianity: A Sketch of the Progress of Thought from Old Testament to New Testament.* By Crawford Howell Toy, Professor in Harvard University. Boston: Little, Brown, and Company, 1890.

theological frame work and make too little of the purely religious side of human nature. Other defects hindered the growth of the Egyptian and the Persian religions. The three great religions of to-day, Prof. Toy thinks, are destined to occupy the whole world, and the victory over the other two is to rest finally with Christianity, not however without important modifications of existing Christian creeds. This prediction of victory is based partly on the moral and spiritual superiority of Christianity and partly on outward conditions, notably the relations of this religion to the leading nations of the world.

The transition from this introduction to the subject proper of the book is made in a short chapter summing up the results of Israel's religious thought up to Ezra's time. These results are a practical monotheism reached by slow growth and by no means a theoretical and thorough-going monotheism: a reasonably sound and satisfactory system of practical social ethics: the organization of public worship with its two effects—the isolation of the people from their neighbors, and the confirmation and development of the legal conception of life: and the hope of ultimate glory for the nation. This hope had passed through several phases, and in the fifth century B. C. various outward conditions made the people less disposed than formerly and later to look to the future. It is at this point that Dr. Toy's work begins. The centre of the development is Palestine, but the movement of thought among the Jews in Egypt and elsewhere as well as the Persian and Greek influences which have affected Jewish theology have all to be included in the study.

With any supernatural elements in religion the author does not attempt to deal. In the section of the introduction devoted to great men, he admits an inexplicable something in the achievement of the guiding mind. We may understand a man's relation to the past and to his own times, but when we reach the creative moment it is impossible to give the history of the process. This mystery meets us not only in religion but in every department of life, and bears various names, genius, intuition, inspiration. The word inspiration "has been almost exclusively set apart to denote the deep spiritual knowledge and the transforming religious energy which, it has seemed to men, could issue only from a supernatural source" (23).

The eight chapters of the work discuss successively the literature, the doctrine of God, subordinate supernatural beings, man, ethics, the kingdom of God, eschatology, and the relation of Jesus to Christianity.

The most important subject at the outset of the study is the date and the chronological order of the writings which furnish the materials of the discussion. Lack of space has forced the writer to content himself with brief indications of the ground of his chronological classification and he refers the reader for details to the works of Reuss, Kuenen, Stade, Weiss, Meyer and others (Preface). Both the literary development and the canons are sketched in a comprehensive way. The period of the great prophets is past. The reconstruction of the national life under the control of Law made necessary a re-writing of the old history from a new point of view. Chronicles, Ezra and Nehemiah belong about 300 B. C. Jonah, Esther, Judith and Tobit fall between 250 and 150 B. C. In the same period come the books of Wisdom including Proverbs, Ecclesiastes, The wisdom of Solomon, and The Wisdom of the Son of Sirach. Marked Greek influences are clear in those Wisdom books. "The body of the Psalter came into existence after the year 350 B. C." (61). From this book "the theology of the Greek period may be constructed with considerable fullness" (61). After the Wisdom literature in chronological

order come the apocalypses, a natural product of the Greek and Roman oppression and of the Maccabæan triumph. Here belong Daniel, about B. C. 164, Enoch, somewhat later, the Sibylline Oracles, Baruch, the Assumption of Moses, the Psalter of Solomon (shortly after B. C. 48), Jubilees, Second Esdras, the Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs and the Ascension of Isaiah. The books bearing the name Maccabees, and the works of Josephus are also of value for the history of religious thought. Philo (first half of the first century of our era) exercised a deep influence on Christian thought.

Parallel with the development of the literature was the movement toward the establishment of a canon, i. e., the selection and collection of books believed to be of divine inspiration and of absolute authority. The details are meagre regarding the principles of selection. The tests were external and internal: a book to be chosen needed the support of some recognized high authority, and the contents had also to commend themselves to the best thought of the time (69). Other religions besides Judaism have developed canons. The order of the Jewish canons was the Law, closed in the days of Ezra and Nehemiah; the Prophetic Writings, closed about 250 B. C.; and the Non-Prophetic Writings ("ethical-religious discussions, proverbs, histories, stories, temple-songs and apocalypses"), a century later. Besides these three Palestinian collections, the Greek translation made in Egypt in the third and second centuries B. C. included various other writings (the Apocrypha). This canon was probably closed in the first century B. C. Still other works never attained a place in the canon at all.

The Doctrine of God is the subject of chapter II. At the introduction of the complete Levitical law in the fifth century, B. C., monotheism was practically established though the belief was not theoretically complete. The governmental side of the idea of God was early developed. He controls all individuals and nations. But his rule has special regard for Israel. "The conception of a universal, divine providence in the form in which it is now held is not found in the earlier books of the Old Testament" (79). He has in the late literature close connection with inanimate and brute nature. He is held to be just, but the content of this word is determined by the ethical ideas of the age. The wicked and the enemies of Israel are hardly thought of as having rights. In the New Testament likewise we sometimes find the belief that God's judgments are determined by non-ethical considerations, but in the Sermon on the Mount is the pure ethical conception: "the divine justice in estimating men takes into account only their conformity to the law of right" (83).

That God is a being of love is a view which naturally arose later, depending as it does on a more advanced stage of society. The idea was at first a national one. Yahwe loves Israel. The conception of God's faithful care of the individual arose later, perhaps a couple of centuries before our era. It is fully stated in the Sermon on the Mount. It is probable that the growth of the conception was aided by the influence of Greek thought (86).

There is a parallel growth of the belief in God as pure spirit and in his personal spiritual relation to the individual man. The Babylonian exile greatly helped to throw off the local conception which bound God to the Jerusalem temple and to special forms of worship. The growth was slow. It was hard to get rid of nationalism, which was shared even by the earliest Christians. But the entrance of Gentiles into the Church made a change necessary.

The section on the hypostatic differences in the divine nature (89-121) is one

of much importance. All religions tend toward the development of a pantheon and the introduction of a mediating power between the deity and the world. The later Judaism, while discarding polytheism, still felt the necessity of differentiating the functions of God and bringing him into contact with man's life. Among arrested growths may be named the "face or presence of God," "the name" and the "angel of Yahwe." The term "spirit," often used in a vague way, shows marked tendency to be treated as a personality. Philo means by it more than a mere name for divine power. In the New Testament there is evident advance of the hypostatic conception of the spirit, due probably chiefly to Gentile Christianity.

The Old Testament personification of Wisdom approaches the very verge of hypostasis but does not reach it. The conception is a philosophical one, based on the orderly course of nature. In the growth of the idea the influence of Greek thought is clear. Complete hypostasis of wisdom was not reached even by the Wisdom of Solomon, or by Philo, though in Wisdom 7 : 26, 27, (cf. Heb. 1 : 2, 3) it is described as "the reflection of the everlasting light, a mirror and image of God, omnipotent for good" (101). The "word" or Logos attained a complete hypostatical form and a longer discussion is accordingly devoted to the history of the process. In Isa. 55 : 11, "my word shall not return to me void," etc., there is an approach to personification. In some of the Psalms the personification is more distinct. Although the conception did not keep its hold on Jewish thought, it probably helped the foundation of the Christian doctrine of the "word." Philo's doctrine of the logos is many-sided and intricate. In its nature the logos is, according to this writer, "the personalization of the divine energy which mediates between God and the world" (111). The function and work of the logos are in accordance with this conception. He is the director of the life of the world, its actual maker, the "oldest son" of the father of beings, "the first begotten." The world is his garment. He is mediator between God and man. It is true that Philo has also other representations of the logos, but in spite of diversities there is a "very serious and persistent unity in his portrayal of the logos as shaper and director of all things,—the mediator between God and the world" (112). The logos is a creature of God, but a Jewish monotheist could take no other view. Philo was not in a position to conceive a complete hypostatization of the logos. His view was much influenced by Stoic philosophy. The final step was taken by the writer of the Fourth Gospel, who identifies the logos with Jesus of Nazareth. This writer adds nothing to what is found in Philo on the subject of the logos except the incarnation. The two elements in the process of identifying Jesus and the logos are "the gradual idealizing of the person of Jesus, and the acceptance by a part of the Christian world of the Greek philosophy as adapted to monotheistic ideas by the Alexandrian Jews" (116). In the New Testament itself there are two distinct lines of advance regarding the person of Jesus,—the one Pauline, the other Alexandrian. The former was soteriological, the latter philosophical (120). "The New Testament, with all the grandeur of character and function that it ascribes to the Christ, maintains the unique supremacy of the one God" (121).

The next section is devoted to the "conception of the relation of God's self-manifestation to the laws of the natural world." At first there was no sharp distinction between natural and supernatural. The deity was everywhere, showing himself on all occasions of life. A second stage of belief regards Israel as under the special care and guidance of its God, who often interferes

in its behalf. But besides this view there was also the non-religious way of looking at life as in the story of Samson and in the book of Esther. The world is thought of as governed by law and all things run their well-ordered course. Miraculous interventions appear at various stages, notably in the oldest history and in the times of Samson, Elijah, and Elisha. In the New Testament there is again an outburst of miracle, whose ground Prof. Toy finds in "the belief that the Messianic age, as the final era of prosperity for Israel, would be ushered in and maintained by the direct introduction of divine power" (125). Reverent tradition ascribed the power of miracles to Jesus, and for centuries the Church supposed that every great saint had the same power. The New Testament view is the same as that of the theocratic stage in the Old Testament representation.

As an appendage to the doctrine of God there is a section devoted to the authority accorded to the Scriptures from the time of Ezra to the end of the first Christian century.

Chapter III., on subordinate supernatural beings, treats of survivals from early animistic beliefs (teraphim, demons, magic, Azazel), of spirits and of angels. In the development of the doctrine of angels Persian influence is seen. Particularly instructive are the pages devoted to Satan (154-172). The first appearance of "the adversary" is post-exilic, and his function is to oppose the welfare of Israel, as in Zechariah. In Job his relations are with humanity, he is attached to the person and service of God, is "a member of the divine court, presents himself among the sons of God before the divine throne, is called on by Yahwe to make report of his doings, and receives from him his commission to test the character of Job" (156). After 1 Chron. 21, where he incites David to number Israel, he appears no more in the Old Testament. The Wisdom of Solomon identifies him with the serpent tempter of Genesis 3. Enoch makes him the head and ruler of evil spirits, who do his wicked bidding (158). Between Enoch and the New Testament he does not appear in the literature. But since he is a well-developed figure in the earliest parts of the New Testament, we may conclude that in the preceding two centuries he had formed a distinct part of Jewish belief (159). It is not easy to account for the origin of the belief in Satan. The conception seems to have been forced on the Jewish religious consciousness by the circumstances of the time (167). In the later development of the doctrine of Satan and evil spirits the influence of the Persian system is unmistakable.

The chapter on man considers his constitution, the nature and origin of sin, the removal of sin, the conception of righteousness in the Old Testament and in the New Testament. While the whole chapter will claim the attention of the reader, the sections on the removal of sin and the New Testament conception of righteousness will be found of peculiar interest. On the latter point an antithesis is found between the teachings of Jesus and Paul. As appears from the Synoptics, Jesus accepted the national system of sacrifices and the national law (266). "His conception of righteousness was nomistic in so far as it was conceived of by him as obedience to law" (268). "As far as we can judge, his hope for the nation was that it should continue under the Law, only with a higher spirit of obedience" (268). It is precisely here that his conception of righteousness is peculiar and revolutionary. The divine father of men must be the standard of human conduct, and the highest motive of life must be the desire to be in perfect harmony with him. Jesus finds the source of this spiritual righteousness in the soul itself. He speaks of no mediator, but

pictures man as standing face to face with God and dealing with him alone.

"A radical change in the conception of righteousness was introduced by the Apostle Paul" (271). To him it seemed that perfect righteousness was to be prepared and bestowed by God himself. The righteousness of the perfect and glorified Messiah is imputed to the believer. This idea of a transfer of moral character was not strange to Paul's generation, is indeed a familiar one in the preceding and succeeding Jewish literature (272, 273). The instrument by which this righteousness was to be appropriated is faith, of which Paul finds a hint in the history of Abraham (Gen. 15 : 6). To Paul's view of the plan of salvation there is a profoundly spiritual side. "He who believes, not only has no desire to sin, but has intense desire to do what is pleasing in the sight of God, and performs from an inward impulse of love what others wearily toil over, urged on by a mechanical and commercial hope of salvation" (276). There is assimilation to the perfect character of Jesus, a desire to be free from sin, a psychological process culminating in "the establishment of a hearty and intimate friendship with God" (277). It is here that Paul shows his deep insight into human nature," and it is here that his teaching in its last analysis, in spite of all dogmatic differences, is at one with the teaching of the Master.

The chapter on the kingdom of God is largely devoted to the New Testament teachings on this subject and is a full and able presentation of the material. Lack of space forbids an analysis of its contents. In the chapter on eschatology there is much information regarding the doctrines of immortality, resurrection, a final judgment, and the abode of the righteous. The growth of these various doctrines is carefully traced.

The final chapter on the relation of Jesus to Christianity is perhaps the one which will first attract the attention of the reader. In discarding the national idea of religion and making the essence of the new life to be the purity of the individual soul, Jesus becomes the founder of a new faith. "Jesus announced those germinal principles of which the succeeding history of Christianity is only a development" (416). He grasped the situation as no one else did. It seems improbable that he represented himself as a sacrifice for sin (419). "Decidedly alien to his teaching is the dogma that justification before the divine tribunal was effected by his righteousness imputed to the believer" (421). He contemplates no intermediating between God and man. He knew himself to be the Son of God in the sense of his consciousness of profound sympathy with the divine mind. But he did not declare himself to be God. His life made a deep impression and after his death his name became the bond of union for his disciples. In the dogmatic development that followed, Paul was the constructive mind. But the person of Jesus assimilated all the elements of thought of the time. His wonderful power is shown by the variety and vividness of the portraiture of him, and by the activity and enthusiasm of thought which they exhibit (433). Since his day there have been many theological changes, but he remains ever the leader and model of religious experience, and "he alone is in the highest sense the founder of Christianity" (435).

Such is a brief outline of one of the most significant and important modern contributions to theological literature. The attempt to comprehend Judaism and Christianity historically, assigning to internal and external forces their due influence in the process of development, is in harmony with the spirit of the age. It is true that the idea of treating the history in this scientific fashion will grieve many readers, because it runs counter to preconceptions. But it must be said that Prof. Toy does not deny divine guidance in the history. He

would allow a fashioning hand, a leading thought, behind all the phenomena. Only it is the same hand and thought which show themselves in all human development. They lie beyond our comprehension. The author's task is to present the steps of the growth in a systematic way and to show how each phase of the development proceeds from its predecessor. While enormous significance is allowed to the persons and teachings of Jesus and Paul, and the Christian movement is recognized as a great outburst of spiritual energy, yet at the same time the development of thought is traced uninterruptedly from Old Testament to New Testament, but always with strict adhesion to the data furnished by the literature. Even those who cannot lay aside their repugnance to this method of treating "sacred history," will find Prof. Toy's book highly instructive, especially in the array of extra-biblical sources of influence.

Some readers will judge the work by its attitude toward the supernatural. The view that the miracles ascribed to Jesus are the product of "reverent tradition" will seem to them unsatisfactory. But the work will have immense value to any thoughtful person, even though on this point he feels constrained to ascribe historical value to the tradition. The book is a storehouse of information aside from any theory regarding the supernatural. The exalted theme, the dignified and lucid style, the calm, scientific tone, the evident mastery of details, above all the comprehensive, natural, and attractive array of the material, will make this work a welcome addition to many libraries.

The well-digested table of contents (10 pages), the index of citations from the Scriptures, Apocrypha, Philo and Josephus (7 pages), and the index of subjects (12 pages) make the use of the work very easy for purposes of reference. The large type and beautiful mechanical execution add no little to the pleasure of the reader.